

GREAT LAKES FISHERY COMMISSION

1987 Project Completion Report<sup>1</sup>

Regulation Of Water Quality In Lake Michigan:  
Report Of the Food Web Workshop

by:

James F. Kitchell, Marlene S. Evens, Donald Scavia, and Larry B.  
Crowder

October 1987

<sup>1</sup>Project completion reports of Commission-sponsored research are made available to the Commission's Cooperators in the interest of rapid dissemination of information that may be useful in Great Lakes fishery management, research, or administration. The reader should be aware that project completion reports have not been through a peer review process and that sponsorship of the project by the Commission does not necessarily imply that the findings or conclusions are endorsed by the Commission.

REGULATION OF WATER QUALITY IN LAKE MICHIGAN:

REPORT OF THE FOOD WEB WORKSHOP

**James F. Kitchell**

Center for Limnology  
University of Wisconsin  
Madison WI 53706

**Marlene S. Evans**

Great Lakes Research Division  
University of Michigan  
Ann Arbor MI 48109

**Donald Scavia**

Great Lakes Environmental Research Laboratory  
Ann Arbor, MI 48105

**Larry B. Crowder**

Department of Zoology  
North Carolina State University  
Raleigh NC 26795

*Accepted  
from Brooks to  
Sonzogni Oct 87  
Citations  
Updated  
2/00/87*

ABSTRACT. During the past 20 years, Lake Michigan has experienced substantial reduction in nutrient inputs, major changes in the biological community and re-configuration of the pelagic food web. Alewife, the previously dominant zooplanktivore, has decreased to 10-20% of its former abundance, a new assemblage of zooplankton has become dominant and summer water clarity has increased nearly three-fold in that time. This report summarizes the consensus of participants in an <sup>INTERNATIONAL JOINT COMMISSION</sup> (IJC)-sponsored Workshop, on Food Web Interactions convened in Ann Arbor during 4-6 December 1985. In general, physical-chemical conditions are the major regulators of water <sup>QUALITY</sup> clarity during spring and fall periods. Food web effects are most manifest in offshore waters during the period of summer stratification. Discussion during the workshop led to insights regarding the causes of recent changes, their association with nutrient controls and/or food web interactions, and the likely dimensions for future effects.

ADDITIONAL INDEX WORDS: Phosphorus, nutrients, fish, zooplankton, predation, transparency

RUNNING TITLE: FOOD WEB WORKSHOP

## INTRODUCTION

Recent increases in summer water clarity in Lake Michigan suggest a complex interaction derived from two very different management practices. As a result of the international water quality agreements (Slater and Bangay 1980) and subsequent management actions, a general reduction in nutrient loading has been effected over the past decade and should be expressed in water quality improvements. Similarly, international fisheries agreements (Anon. 1984) have resulted in major changes in the fish communities of Lake Michigan (Wells 1985, Jude and Tesar 1985, Kitchell and Crowder 1986). Development of sea lamprey control programs and increased stocking of salmon and trout now form the basis for an immensely successful, high-value sport fishery (Talhelm et al. 1979, Talhelm 1985). The effects of enhanced predator populations cascade through food webs and can be expressed in a miscellany of water quality variables (Carpenter et al. 1985). Thus, observed water quality changes can be associated with nutrient abatement and/or food web effects.

Scavia et al. (1986) and Lesht and Rockwell (1985) provide evidence that the general reduction in phosphorus loading over the past decade is reflected in surface water chemistry. An important departure from the general trend became most apparent during the summers of 1983-85 as evidenced by substantial increases in water clarity. Although other limnological variables show less apparent effects, the increase in water clarity is readily perceived by the public and, therefore, of interest to both the basic and applied scientific institutions. Recent observations with regard to composition of the biological community and food web interactions also demonstrate most extreme changes during the summers of 1983-85 (Scavia et al. 1986). For example, the exotic alewife declined to

abundances lower than any observed for more than two decades and many native fish species exhibited increases of equivalent magnitude (Wells 1985).

This report summarizes the results of a workshop organized through the Ecological Considerations Committee under the aegis of the Science Advisory Board of the International Joint Commission. The general goal of the workshop was to bring together researchers currently involved with the various components of the interactions between nutrient control and food web control of water quality. This meeting sought to increase our collective understanding of the cause and effect relationships underlying the recent changes in Lake Michigan. In addition, we invited representatives of research groups and agencies that might profit from our discussions as they developed plans for work on other Great Lakes. The workshop was held in Ann Arbor, Michigan, during 4-6 December 1985. This brief summary is designed to convey a sense of the magnitude of changes occurring in Lake Michigan and the spectrum of forces effecting those changes.

## HIGHLIGHTS OF THE CONTRIBUTIONS

Lake-wide stock assessment data presented by L. Wells (U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service) document the recent, substantial changes in abundance of fishes in Lake Michigan (Wells 1985). Jude (Univ. Michigan) presented evidence from nearshore monitoring in southeastern regions of the lake that suggests changes similar to those for the whole lake but preceding them by several years (Jude and Tesar 1985). The alewife (Alosa pseudoharengus) population increase during the early 1960's had profound effects on Lake Michigan's zooplankton (Wells 1970). Alewife remained the dominant zooplanktivore for nearly two decades but has declined since the middle 1970's to 10-20% of former abundance. Populations of native fishes such as the deepwater cisco (Coregonus hoyi), deepwater sculpin (Myoxocephalus thompsoni) and yellow perch (Perca falvenscens) have dramatically increased in the past few years. As presented by D. Stewart (Univ. Wisconsin) increasing predation by salmon, trout and charr is the most parsimonious reason for alewife decline (Stewart et al. 1981).

M. Hansen (Wisc. DNR) analyzed size distributions of salmonines taken in Wisconsin's sport fisheries since 1969 (Hansen 1986). Although there is evidence of recent reduction in the mean size and condition of "trophy" chinook salmon (Oncorhynchus tshawytscha), the several-fold reduction in estimated alewife abundance--the major prey species--has not been generally reflected in predator growth and condition indices recorded through 1984. This unexpected result remains unexplained.

Extensive surveys of benthos were conducted throughout the southern basin of Lake Michigan during the 1960's. Nalepa (NOAA, Great Lakes Env. Res. Lab.) designed and conducted a similar program during 1980 as a basis for assessment of changes over the past two decades (Nalepa-<sup>1987</sup>MS). The 1980

abundance of major benthic species was generally severalfold that observed during the 1960's. Benthic invertebrate populations increased in ways that can be directly associated with the general decline in alewife observed after peak abundance occurred in the mid-1960's. Crowder (North Carolina State Univ.) summarized recent work conducted at southern basin stations near Grand Haven, Michigan. Deepwater cisco is now much more abundant than alewife in that region of the lake and is likely responsible for local declines in the abundance of their primary benthic prey (Mysis relicta and Pontoporeia affinis) observed over the period of 1977-85 (Crowder et al. <sup>1987</sup>MS, McDonald et al. MS).

As summarized by M. Evans (Univ. Michigan), large zooplankton began to reappear in increasing abundance as the alewife decline developed in the early 1980's. In particular, the increase of large Daphnia species in offshore waters during summers of 1983-85 is regarded as substantial evidence of changing food web interactions. Gradual changes in the nearshore zooplankton also reflect the reduction in predation by declining alewife followed more recently by increased predation on larger zooplankton as nearshore native fish populations recovered (Evans and Jude 1986). Discussion confirmed the general impression that recent fish and zooplankton community changes have and are occurring as gradients seen first in the nearshore, southeastern regions of the lake then proceeding over time to the offshore and more northerly and <sup>westerly</sup>~~easterly~~ regions. The sustained high abundance of large Daphnia in offshore waters during summer months remains remarkable in that the recovery of native zooplanktivorous fishes has not yet had apparent effect on this typically preferred prey.

Scavia (NOAA, Great Lakes Env. Res. Lab.), demonstrated that reduced concentrations of chlorophyll and increased transparency are directly associated with the seasonal increase of large cladocerans. Based on the

experimental studies conducted by Lehman (Univ. Michigan) in collaboration with Scavia's cruise series, total water column grazing rates have increased several-fold as Daphnia spp. have come to dominance in summers since 1983. Intensified grazing of the epilimnetic phytoplankton is the apparent cause of remarkably increased water transparency most apparent during the latter months of recent summers (Scavia et al. 1986).

A review of water quality data collected over the last two decades (Lesht, Argonne Nat'l Lab.) reveals that the most general indicator of water quality--Secchi depth--has changed nearly three-fold since alewife were most abundant. In the middle 60's, summer Secchi depths recorded before whittings began were generally 4-5 meters (Lesht and Rockwell 1985). Summer Secchi depths were regularly 15 meters or more in recent years (Scavia et al. 1986).

Historical and paleolimnological studies also revealed major shifts in community composition and food web interactions. Brooks' (Univ. Wisconsin-Milw.) analysis of phytoplankton community changes determined at the Milwaukee water intake suggest long-term trends in phytoplankton composition that reflect inter-annual differences due to seasonal, weather effects and a main trend due to altered food web interactions (Brooks et al. 1984). Stoermer (Univ. Michigan) presented results from analysis of sediment cores which suggest that changes in diatom species composition may have begun before food web effects were apparent (Stoermer et al. 1985). It is likely, therefore, that changes in relative nutrient availability (nutrient ratios for N, P and/or Si) have played a major role in the historic diatom community. Kitchell's (Univ. Wisconsin) review of analysis of zooplankton fossils and plant pigments in cores also reflects the major changes in food web interactions coincident with the invasion and explosive increase of alewife during the 1960's (Kitchell and



Carpenter 1987). Changes in the abundance and morphology of Bosmina fossils reflect the relative abundance of large, predaceous copepods which were substantially reduced during the period of abundant alewife. At the same time, small herbivorous copepods increased and the concentration of grazing-related chlorophyll degradation products increased in sediment samples. The most recent decline in alewife abundance and dramatic changes in the plankton community observed since 1980 are not yet represented in the sediment record.

## DISCUSSION

### Controls of Water Quality

Discussion during the presentations and working group sessions evoked a general view of the hierarchy and interactions of factors currently controlling water quality in Lake Michigan. Spring phytoplankton densities are regulated by a combination of vernal mixing, nutrient loading and relative nutrient concentrations. Community composition is regulated by competition for nutrients, sinking and increased light penetration which interact strongly as thermal stratification develops in late spring. The conditions, mechanisms and dynamics during this period are summarized by Scavia and Fahnenstiel (1987).

Once summer stratification is well developed, food web interactions become a major regulator of the plankton community. Summer phytoplankton densities and composition are controlled by nutrient cycling and grazing by increasing zooplankton populations. Size-selective predation determines the abundance and size of the zooplankton. Recent reduction in the abundance of the alewife due to predation by stocked salmonines is largely responsible for the observed increase in summer water clarity effected through intense grazing by greater numbers of large zooplankton. The major components of food web interactions are summarized in Figure 1. Although these conditions have been developing to varying degrees for several years, they have been most apparent since 1983 and will likely persist in future years given the current and intended practices of fisheries agencies that determine stocking policy.

Summer water clarity is strongly influenced by a cascade of predation effects that begin with intense piscivory, extend to intense herbivory

(Carpenter et al. 1985), and are expressed in competition for nutrients (Scavia et al. 1988). In the years when alewife was the dominant zooplanktivorous fish, summer zooplankton biomass was primarily comprised of calanoid copepods which are highly selective but relatively ineffective algal grazers. During the present decade, alewife have declined in concert with the increased predation of stocked salmonines. Large cladocerans (Daphnia spp.) have become increasingly abundant during summer months. Daphnia are much less selective and highly efficient grazers. Their feeding rates can exceed the growth rates of phytoplankton and water clarity increases as a consequence.

Although food web effects are most manifest during a relatively short period of the annual limnological cycle (Fig. 1), their strongest occurrence during summer months makes improved water quality very apparent to the public. Recreational use of the lake is most intense during those times when increased water clarity is most obvious. Nearshore water quality may exhibit effects of local nutrient sources and food web interactions but the average condition of surface waters will continue to be improved as food web effects in offshore waters develop and persist each summer.

#### **Management for the Future**

The potential for enhancement of food web controls of water quality remains poorly known. The current biological community is dominated by interactions among exotic species. Most of the stocked salmonines and the alewife are not native species in the early history of Lake Michigan. The largest cladoceran species (Daphnia pulicaria) which was very abundant in the 1983-84 summer zooplankton is not known from any previous work in Lake

Michigan.

There is reason to be concerned about the stability of the present community and little other than speculation can be offered with regard to its future. Through the auspices of the Great Lakes Fisheries Commission, plans are now being developed toward the definition of fish community goals and the coordinated management programs required to establish and sustain them. The resultant fisheries management practices may have substantial impact on water quality. Among the possible outcomes is a reversal of water quality trends in the nearshore zone; reduction of alewife populations has been accompanied by a remarkable increase in littoral fishes such as the yellow perch. Their effects on the nearshore plankton community may be the opposite of those observed in the offshore waters. More recently, the appearance and rapid increase of the exotic, predaceous cladoceran Bythotrephes raises the prospect that an invertebrate predator may flourish in the absence of significant populations of planktivorous fishes. Bythotrephes preys on other cladocerans; it may reduce Daphnia populations and their grazing effect on offshore water clarity during summer months (Scavia et al. 1988).

Clearly, recent changes observed in Lake Michigan and the cause-effect scenario developed above demonstrate the necessity for coordination and effective interaction among agencies charged with water quality considerations and those responsible for fisheries management. We now enjoy improvements in both worlds with regard to public value of Lake Michigan: offshore water clarity during summer months and fishing are better than ever observed in recent decades!

There remain substantial unknowns with regard to the limits of current trends, the specific regulators of variability and the stability of the food web system that creates them. There are strong reasons to expect

similar developments in other lakes. Stocking rates are increasing in Lakes Superior, Huron, Erie and Ontario. The states of Michigan and Wisconsin reduced their 1985 and 1986 stocking rates for Lake Michigan yet the major impact of predation will not be expressed until fish stocked before 1985 complete their life cycle. Piscivory will peak in the period of 1987-89 (Kitchell and Crowder 1986). Restrictions on stocking policy are largely precautionary but will likely persist until a more effective understanding is developed of the current predator-prey system and a rational basis for community-level (i.e., food web) management is formulated. It is no small irony that the alewife--previously a curiosity and then a major nuisance--is now viewed as a major resource.

Water quality improvements sought through nutrient abatement have and will continue to be effective in Lake Michigan. Management that regulates food web effects has and may continue to enhance water quality improvements. The extent and potential for a coordinated management approach that takes advantage of the synergism of nutrient abatement and food web controls has been insufficiently explored. Clearly, research and management planning could profit from a dual consideration in developing programs for future work in the Great Lakes.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First and foremost we thank the workshop participants. Their contributions and creativity are the basis for this report. We apologize for any misrepresentations developed in this distillate. Second, we thank the IJC for its financial and logistic support to this effort. In particular we wish to acknowledge those IJC staff members whose aid and enthusiasm were most beneficial--John Hartig, Trefor Reynoldson, Rich Thomas and John Gannon. Much of the planning and report preparation was performed while J. F. Kitchell was on leave from UW-Madison and in Ann Arbor under joint sponsorship by the NOAA Great Lakes Env. Res. Lab. and the Great Lakes Fishery Commission.

## REFERENCES

- Anonymous. 1984. Annual Report Great Lakes Fishery Commission, 1982. 153 pp. Ann Arbor, Michigan.
- Brooks, A. S., Warren, G. J., Boraas, M. E., Seale, D. B., and Edgington, D. N. 1984. Long-term phytoplankton changes in Lake Michigan: Cultural eutrophication or biotic shifts. Verh. Internat. Verein. Limnol. 22:452-459.
- Carpenter, S. R., Kitchell, J. F., and Hodgson, J. R. 1985. Cascading trophic interactions and lake ecosystem productivity. BioScience 35:634-639.
- Crowder, L. B., McDonald, M. E., and Rice, J. A. 1987. Understanding recruitment of Lake Michigan fishes: the importance of size-based interactions, ~~ontogenetic bottlenecks and zooplankton community composition~~ <sup>between fish and zooplankton,</sup> Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. (submitted). 44: Suppl 2
- Evans, M. S., and Jude, D. J. 1986. Recent Shifts in Daphnia community structure in southeastern Lake Michigan: a comparison of the inshore and offshore regions. Limnol. Oceanogr. 31:56-67.
- Hansen, M. J. 1986. Size and condition of trout and salmon from the Wisconsin waters of Lake Michigan, 1969-1984. Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources Fish Management Report #126. 28 p.
- Jude, D. J. and Tesar, F. J. 1985. Changes in the forage fish of Lake Michigan. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 42(6):1154-1157.
- Kitchell, J. F. and Carpenter, S. R. 1987. Piscivores, planktivores, fossils and phorbins. In Predation: Direct and Indirect Effects on Aquatic Communities, ed. Kerfoot, W. C. and Sih, A. Univ. Press of New England, Hanover, N.H.
- Kitchell, J. F. and Crowder, L. B. 1986. Predator-prey interactions in

Lake Michigan: model predictions and recent dynamics. Env. Biol. Fish.

16:205-211.

Lesht, B. M. and Rockwell, D. C. 1985. The state of the middle Great Lakes: results of the 1983 water quality survey of Lakes Erie, Huron, and Michigan. Rep. No. ANL/ER-85-2, Argonne National Laboratory,

Argonne, Illinois 118 p.

McDonald, M. E., Crowder, L. B., and Brandt, S. B. Changes in Mysis and Pontoporeia populations in southern Lake Michigan: A response to shifts in the fish community? <sup>Limnol. and Oceanogr</sup> ~~Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.~~ (submitted).

Nalepa, T. F. Long-term changes in the macrobenthos of southern Lake Michigan. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. (submitted) 44:575-524.

Scavia, D., Fahnenstiel, G. L., Evans, M. S., Jude, D. J., and Lehman, J. T. 1986. Influence of salmonine predation and weather on long-term water quality trends in Lake Michigan. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 43:435-443.

Scavia, D. and G. L. Fahnenstiel. 1987. Dynamics of Lake Michigan's phytoplankton: mechanisms controlling epilimnetic <sup>communities</sup> ~~populations~~. J. Great Lakes Res. 13:103-120.

Scavia, D., Lang, G. A., and Kitchell, J. F. 1988. Dynamics of Lake Michigan plankton: A model evaluation of nutrient loading, competition and predation. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 45:In press.

Slater, R. W. and Bangay, G. E. 1980. Action taken to control phosphorus in the Great Lakes. In Phosphorus Management Strategies for Lakes, ed. R. C. Loehr, C. S. Martin and W. Rast, pp. 13-26. Ann Arbor: Science Publishers, Inc.

Stewart, D. J., Kitchell, J. F. and Crowder, L. B. 1981. Forage <sup>f</sup> Fishes and their salmonid predators in Lake Michigan. Trans. Amer. Fish. Soc. 110:751-763.

Stoermer, E. S., Wolin, J. A., Schelske, C. L., and Conley, D. J. 1985.



Post-settlement diatom succession in the Bay of Quinte, L. Ontario.

Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 42:754-767.

Talhelm, D. R. 1985. Current estimates of Great Lakes sport fisheries values: 1985 status report. 35 pp. Special Economic Report, Great Lakes Fishery Commission, Ann Arbor Michigan.

Talhelm, D. R., Bishop, R. C., Cox, K. W., Smith, N. W., Steinnes, D. N., and Tuomi, A. L. W. 1979. Current estimates of Great Lakes fisheries values: 1979 status report. Great Lakes Fishery Commission, Ann Arbor, Michigan. 79-1:17 (mimeo).

Wells, L. 1970. Effects of alewife predation on zooplankton populations in Lake Michigan. Limnol. Oceanogr. 15:556-565.

Wells, L. 1985. Changes in Lake Michigan's prey fish populations with increasing salmonid abundance, 1962 to 1984. In Presented papers from the Council of Lake Committees Plenary Session on Great Lakes predator-prey issues, March 20, 1985, ed. R. L. Eshenroder, pp. 15-25. Great Lakes Fish. Comm. Tech. Rep. 85-3.

FIGURE 1

INCREASED  
SALMONINE STOCKING

Increased predation on alewife

Reduced predation on  
large zooplankton

Recovery of native fishes

Increased predation  
on Bosmina

Increased predation on Mysis  
and Pontoporeia

Increased grazing of phytoplankton

REDUCED  
NUTRIENT  
LOADING

Reduced chlorophyll

Increased water clarity

FIGURE 1. Flow diagram of cause-effect interactions expressed during summer conditions in Lake Michigan. Boxes denote direct management actions.